Abstract

A development planning meeting (Musrenbang) is a forum that is carried out to plan a development that is carried out from the lowest to the highest level. E-Murenbang is a system used for Musrenbang activities. The E-Murenbang system is an innovation used by the Bekasi City Government in implementing a plan. Where the results that have been input in the E-Musrenbang application will be integrated with the E-Planning and E-Monev (Monitoring and Evaluation) applications. This research was conducted at the Mustikajaya District Office in Bekasi City. The purpose of this research is to find out the processes and constraints in the application of the E-Musrenbang application at the Mustikajaya District Office. The data analysis uses qualitative analysis by conducting direct interviews with informants as the executor of activities with interviews, field notes, and documentation.

The results showed that the implementation of the Musrenbang and application of the E-Murenbang application in the Mustikajaya District office in Bekasi City had been running well and the application of the E-Musrenbang application had a good impact making it more efficient and effective. Even with the application of this application, the proposals that are submitted can be directly inputted into the system so that there are no more proposals that enter beyond the established mechanism.

Keywords: Development Planning, Musrenbang, E-Murenbang, E-Planning and E-Monev

Introduction

Development planning is the initial stage in the development process before it is implemented. Planning plays an important role because it is used to adjust the objectives to be achieved in development with existing resources and various other alternatives that may be carried out. Planning consists of two things first is the conscious determination of concrete goals to be achieved within a certain period based on the values of the community concerned, and second is the choice between alternative methods that are efficient and rational to achieve goals-these objectives (Mustopadidjaja, 2012: 2). Therefore, to be
able to carry out a good national development requires careful planning so that the objectives to be achieved and the efforts that will be made to achieve these objectives can be implemented.

According to Law No. 25 of 2004 concerning the National Development Planning System (SPPN), Planning is a process to determine the appropriate future actions, through a sequence of choices, taking into account available resources. National Development is an effort carried out by all components of the nation to achieve the objectives of the state. Whereas the National Development Planning System is an integrated development planning procedure for producing long-term, medium-term and annual development plans implemented by elements of state and community organizers at the central and regional levels. According to PP No. 8 of 2008 concerning Stages, Procedures for Preparation, Control, and Evaluation of the Implementation of Regional Development Plans. Regional development is the utilization of the resources that are owned to improve the welfare of the community, both in terms of income, employment opportunities, business field, access to policy-making, competitiveness, and an increase in the human development index. Regional Development Planning is a process of preparing the stages of activities involving various elements of stakeholders in it, to use and allocate existing resources to improve social welfare in an area/region within a certain period.

Law No. 25 of 2004 concerning the National Development Planning System (SPPN) Article 1 paragraph (21) says that the Musrenbang is a forum between actors in the framework of preparing National development plans and regional development plans. The Musrenbang is a formal arena for stakeholders in discussing the priorities of development activities in the regions which will become material for the preparation of the APBD. But in its implementation, Musrenbang often does not reflect the spirit of participatory and dialogical discussion. The Musrenbang cannot yet become a friendly event for the community, especially the poor and women in voicing their aspirations and needs. The voice of the poor is often eliminated when setting priorities for regional development programs and activities.

It must be recognized that for the community, following the Musrenbang process is not always a rich and aspirational experience. In most places, Musrenbang is often only a part of the "ritual" of the planning process which has narrow meaning for residents. Even considered no longer relevant for women and poor groups. Musrenbang is a bottom-up method that is not possessed by every developing country.

The existence of an official Musrenbang in the planning process is an opportunity to truly apply the principles of this bottom-up approach. If related to the budgeting process, Musrenbang is one of the stages where community needs can be identified and budgeted. Whereas the subdistrict Musrenbang is an annual forum for stakeholder discussion at the sub-district level to obtain input on the priority development activities of the relevant sub-district based on village office input, and to agree on planned cross-village/village office activities. The input is at the same time the basis for the preparation of the Subdistrict Development Plan which will be submitted to the authorized SKPD as the compiler for the Work Unit of the Regency / City Regional Apparatus in the following year. Sub-district Musrenbang is held every year in February with an output in the form of Subdistrict Development Plan Documents and input for Subdistrict SKPD work plans. The organizing agencies of the District Musrenbang are the District and Bappeda.

The sub-district has to prepare the technical implementation of the sub-district Musrenbang, form a guiding team, and documents relevant to the implementation of the sub-district Musrenbang. Sub-district Musrenbang does not merely agree on the priority of regional problems in the village office that is proposed by the village office Musrenbang but to produce priority problems and activities which become the obligatory affairs and authorities of the regional government. Besides, Musrenbang is also a forum for citizen education so that it becomes an active part of governance and development.

In general, the implementation of the subdistrict Musrenbang is intended to accommodate the aspirations and input of development activities from the community at the regional level which are aligned with the development plans that are being prepared by the regional government, both sectoral and regional. It is hoped that the involvement of the sub-district / regional community in the planning process can optimize development plans that can solve the problems and needs of the community in general, especially those in the area concerned.

In the era of increasingly advanced technology, the Development Planning Conference (Musrenbang) has used an electronic system called E-Musrenbang. E-Musrenbang is a website-based planning application that was built to support the
efforts of planning synergy between the central government and regional governments in the preparation of Government Work Plans both at the Center and in the Regions. This application was developed and developed by the Ministry of National Development Planning/National Development Planning Agency (Ministry of PPN/Bappenas). The application of E-Musrenbang 2015 website-based application is expected to really facilitate the process of planning synergy between the central government and regional governments, in particular, the synergy of planning and budgeting that is tailored to the needs; and encourage the application of governance principles that are participatory, transparent, effective and efficient, and accountable in the delivery of public services from the Ministry of PPN/Bappenas. The first province to implement e-Musrenbang was DKI Jakarta Province which was conducted in 2016.

In Bekasi, the application of the E-Musrenbang Application was only carried out in 2018 based on Mayor Regulation No. 01. A 2018 Challenge the Application of E-Musrenbang in the Compilation of Work Plan Documents in the Bekasi City Government Environment. Mustikajaya Subdistrict is an area included in the Bekasi City Government Environment with a population of 228,609 based on the 2015 Bekasi City BPS data. Mustikajaya Subdistrict also participated in implementing the e-Musrenbang application which is currently being carried out by the Bekasi city government through Virtual Musrenbang which will be inputted. Into the E-Musrenbang application.

Virtual Musrenbang has several advantages, including the first, efficient and effective implementation of the Musrenbang. Second, it allows the Regional Head/Head of Bappeda to have direct dialogue with all participants of the Musrenbang. This cannot be done in the usual process because of distance and recent spread, evaluating capabilities and knowledge, as well as the availability of information and communication technology (ICT) in the region. Therefore, more adequate facilities and infrastructure for supporting virtual Musrenbang are needed, as well as competent HR operators for inputting submitted proposals.

The sub-district virtual Musrenbang will be held for one day, followed by all sub-districts and having a dialogue with the City Team (Bappeda and regional apparatus). Each district submits, discusses, and agrees on issues/problems that will be resolved together, accompanied by complete data. The City Team paneled addressed issues/problems in the region and responded, discussed solutions together with the sub-district. The dialogue time per district is 15 minutes. During the 2013-2018 Musrenbang, the total aspirational funding needs of the community in 12 sub-districts and 56 villages totaled Rp. 7 trillion.

Literature Review

1. Development Planning

Since the issuance of Law No. 25/2004 concerning the National Development Planning System (SPPN 2004), the position of regional development planning in Indonesia has become stronger. The argument that originally developed about the necessity of development is regulated through the planning system in the era of regional autonomy, automatically does not need to be debated anymore. With the existence of this law, every government apparatus in carrying out its daily activities and if this is not done will have certain legal implications.

From another point of view, exiting the 2004 SPPN also called for significant changes in the preparation of regional development planning documents in Indonesia. These changes include: First, concerning the types of regional development planning documents that need to be made, the technical preparation of the plan also experienced a pretty fundamental change. Third, the stages of the preparation of the plan also experienced changes to be able to implement a Participatory Planning System (Participatory Planning) to increase the absorption of people's aspirations in the preparation of development plans.

Besides, with the commencement of the implementation of regional autonomy since 2001, the role of regional governments has become increasingly important in encouraging the development process in their respective regions. The change in the regional government system encouraged all regions to compete to accelerate the process of regional development in the welfare of the people of the region concerned. Such conditions cause the increasingly important role of regional development planning as a forum for exercising regional authority in encouraging regional development activities in a more directed and systematic manner.
Planning is a way, technique or method to achieve the desired goals precisely, directed and efficient following available resources. Thus in general development planning is a way or technique to achieve development goals precisely, directed and efficient following the conditions of the country or region concerned. While the development goal, in general, is to encourage the development process more quickly to realize an advanced, prosperous and prosperous society.

The available scientific literature provides some understanding of development planning in the form of various definitions. Lewis (1965) defines planning as a collection of development policies and programs to stimulate the public and the private sector to use available resources productively.

Meanwhile, the stimulus is provided in the form of economic incentives both micro and macro that can encourage the use of power sources more increased. Then Jhingan (1984: 25) an Indian development planning expert gave a more concrete definition of the planning of development. In Jhingan's opinion: "development planning is the deliberate control and regulation of the economy by a central authority (government) to achieve certain goals and objectives within a certain period". This is in line with what is said by Todaro (2000: 25) which defines that economic planning can be described as follows: "a deliberate government effort to coordinate economic decision making in the long term to influence directly or indirectly the growth rates of several main variables of the national economy ".

Meanwhile, according to Law No. 25 of 2004 defines development planning as follows: "The National Development Planning System is a unified development planning procedure for producing long-term, medium-term and annual development plans implemented by state and community organizing elements at the Central and Regional level". The difference between this definition and the previous one is that besides development planning at the National level, the definition of the role of development at the Regional level has been explicitly stated. This is not surprising because this law was indeed made when Indonesia had implemented regional autonomy as a whole where the role of the regional government as a whole where the role of the Regional Government was increasingly prominent in the development process.

From the several definitions and definitions of development planning above it is clear that the main components of development planning are basically:

1. It is a planned and systematic effort by the Government to control and regulate the development process.
2. Covers long, medium and annual periods.
3. Regarding the variables that affect the overall economic growth of development both directly and indirectly.
4. Have a clear development target following the wishes of the community.

The goals and objectives of development planning in Indonesia to encourage the development process in an integrated and efficient manner. This can be seen from the 5 main objectives and functions as follows:

a. Supporting coordination between development actors.
b. Ensure the creation of integration, synchronization, and synergy between regions, the time and function of government, both central and regional.
c. Ensure linkages and consistency between planning, budgeting, implementation, and supervision.
d. Optimizing the interrelationship and consistency between planning, budgeting, implementation, and supervision.
e. Ensuring the use of resources efficiently, effectively and fairly.

2. Good Governance

The concept of governance is one of the central public issues regarding the management of public organizations. This is in line with the increasing demands from the public regarding the implementation of good governance in line with the increasing public awareness about the quality of public services that need to be improved. This issue is also related to the paradigm shift from conventional or traditional governance to a new paradigm that empowers the public as the main stakeholder in government or is often referred to as the government to become a governance system as a manifestation of increasingly modern public. The main purpose of implementing good governance is to build "the professional government", not in the sense of a government-managed by technocrats, but by anyone who has professional qualifications, namely those who have adequate and competent knowledge in their fields.

Good governance is a system and mechanism that regulates the pattern of relationships between government, business / private sector and the community in the framework of implementing a clean, democratic, effective and efficient government
following the ideals of a prosperous, prosperous and independent civil society (Priansa, 2017: 29). According to Priansa (2017: 30), Good governance aims to optimize the function of public organization services following the demands and expectations. Specifically, good governance has the following objectives:

a. Maximize the function of public organizations by implementing the principles of good governance so that public organizations can serve the public well;

b. Promoting professional, transparent, and efficient management of public organizations, and empowering functions and increasing organizational independence;

c. Encourage organizations to be able to make policies that are appropriate to their capacities and capabilities based on high moral values and compliance with applicable laws and regulations;

d. Increasing the contribution of public organizations in developing public services within the framework of the nation and state;

e. The success of the work programs that have been set by the government.

Good governance has several important benefits. By adapting the concept presented by the OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development) 2004: 30, the benefits of good governance in public organizations are as follows:

1. Launching a decision-making process, increasing efficiency, and creating a healthier work culture. The performance of public organizations will improve;

2. The impact of minimizing the actions of abuse of authority by the leadership in managing the organization;

3. The value of public organizations in the eyes of stakeholders will increase as a result of increasing their confidence in the ability to manage public organizations;

4. Motivation and job satisfaction of employees of public organizations are also expected to increase. This increase in the next stage will certainly also be able to increase the productivity and sense of belonging of employees towards public organizations;

5. The increased quality of the financial statements of public organizations can produce reports with the highest value from the State Audit Board (BPK).

One of the main keys to understanding good governance understands the principles within it. These principles relate to good governance control that is designated for meeting the needs and expectations of the public as the main stakeholders. Implementation of the principles of good governance will determine the level of performance of the government itself.

3. District Musrenbang

Development Planning Deliberation or commonly called Musrenbang is a forum between actors in the framework of compiling National development plans and regional development plans. Following the mandate of the 2004 SPPN, Musrenbang has two main functions. First, as a tool to coordinate the preparation of development planning among various actors of development activities. The purpose of this coordination is clearly to be able to realize integrated development activities and support one another so that the development process will be more effective and efficient. Second, as a tool to absorb community participation in the preparation of planning by involving various community leaders, clever, clever, religious scholars, and traditional leaders. According to Sjafrizal (2014: 120), the main objective, in this case, is that the plans arranged can be adjusted to the aspirations of the general public so that community support in the implementation of development will be optimized. This means that the Musrenbang also functions as a tool to be able to realize the Participatory Planning system which is one form of applying the principles of democracy in the implementation of development. The Districts Musrenbang is an annual forum for stakeholder discussion at the sub-district level to obtain input on the priority activities of the relevant sub-district development areas. Based on village office input, and agreeing on the planned cross-village/village office activities concerned. Understanding about the Sub-district outlined in Government Regulation No. 19/2008 concerning District Government. According to PP No. 19/2008 Article 1, Sub-district or other designation is "the working area of the Camat as the apparatus of the Regency / City". As a sub-district working area, the Sub-district area covers a minimum of 10 Villages for a district, and a minimum of 5 Villages for an Urban Area (Article 6). Aside from being defined as the district head's working area, the sub-district is also defined as "a regional technical implementer that has a specific work area led by the sub-district head" (Article 14).

From these two meanings, it can be concluded that the sub-district is not an autonomous entity like a village, but is part of the bureaucratic system of the Regional Government (Regency / City). Therefore, the Subdistrict does not have the right to regulate and manage their affairs in their area. Thus, the affairs and authorities inherent in the sub-districts are part of the
mandatory authority and choices of the regional government. Besides, in the case of development planning and implementation, the function of the sub-district is only coordinative (Article 15). Therefore it can be concluded that the District Musrenbang is an arena for coordination and synergizing various development proposals from the Village/Village office which are part of the affairs of the Regional Government (Regency/City).

According to PP No. 8/2008 Article 20 paragraphs (1), Sub-District Musrenbang is part of a series of activities in the Musrenbang Development Work Plan (RKPD). In that article, it was stated that "Regency/City RKPD Musrenbang starts from the Village Musrenbang or other designations/Village office, and Districts or other designations". The result of the Districts Musrenbang is the Districts Development Plan. This can be seen from Article 18 paragraph (4) which states "Regency / City RKPD Musrenbang is implemented for the integration of the Inter-SKPD Work Plan and the Sub-District Development Plan". Besides PP No.19/2018 concerning District Article 29 paragraph (1) states, "In the context of administering the government in the District, a development plan is prepared as a continuation of the results of the Village / Urban Village Development Planning Consultation".

From these articles, several conclusions can be drawn. Sub-district Musrenbang produces Sub-district Development Plans. The sub-district development plan is a plan document containing the usual short-term (1 year) program/activity that will be implemented the following year. Programs and activities which become the mandatory and optional affairs and authorities of the Regional Government (Regency / City) will be proposed to be part of the Regional Development Work Plan (RKPD). In principle, the District Musrenbang is an initial arena for meeting two planning approaches, namely a bottom-up in the form of proposals from the village office level, and a technocratic approach (top-down), in the form of a priority activity program derived from the RPJMD document. One of the second points of this approach in the District Musrenbang is the application of indicative ceilings and regional priority criteria. Indicative ceilings for the development of the Districts area are based on calculations made by Bappeda. Regional Priority Criteria are derived from the direction and regional development policy of the RPJMD.

4. Application of E-Musrenbang

In the era of technological advances in the E-Musrenbang application is an innovation in the application-based development planning process that was built to support the efforts of synergy between Central and Regional Development. E-Musrenbang is an application used to accommodate participatory planning processes in development planning in Bekasi City through the electronic system. This is to create consistency in the stages of regional development planning and to realize transparency, effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability of development planning to support the improvement of public service performance and encourage good and clean governance by utilizing information technology to produce consistent quality planning results.

The E-Musrenbang application will be integrated with applications such as e-planning. E-planning applications according to Perwal No. 62 of 2014 Article 1 paragraph (39) is a general and special application, where a general application is an application that can be used to propose all registered stakeholders to propose activities. The specific application is the application used by the Regional Government to propose activities and manage data at each stage of the planning process which subsequently becomes part of the regional annual planning document. The E-Musrenbang system itself regulates the submission of activity proposals, management of verification data and selection of activity proposals and determination of budget plans. In its management, those responsible for the E-Musrenbang application are:

a. Head of Bappeda as the person in charge of managing the E-Musrenbang application;
b. Head of Regional Development Analysis, Program Planning, Data, Evaluation and Reporting as the person in charge of the daily management of the E-Musrenbang system;
c. Head of Regional Development Program Planning Subdivision at Bappeda as the central administrator of the E-Musrenbang Application as the technical person in charge of the E-Musrenbang application.

The central administrator referred to above is responsible for the continuity, smoothness, and security of the E-Musrenbang application; providing information related to the development of proposed activities included in the E-
Musrenbang application system; Application security and handling problems and complaints from E-Musrenbang application users. The central administrator is assisted by the E-Musrenbang Application Management Team which consists of a Technical Team and a Supporting Team. Technical Team, namely experts/personnel who are experts and experienced in the field of information systems and technology. While the Supporting Team consists of implementing members of Bappeda, consisting of Super Admins and Field Admins.

Users of the E-Musrenbang application who submit proposals through E-Musrenbang consist of Regional, Sub-District, Village, RW and DPRD officials. In the implementation, the application user will get a username and password from the Central Administrator. The central administrator can also terminate E-Musrenbang users if the user violates the provisions and disrupts the E-Musrenbang system. In its use the E-Musrenbang application in the sub-district is implemented with the following conditions:

1. The sub-district manages the use of E-Musrenbang;
2. The Camat Secretary is responsible for utilizing the E-Musrenbang application;
3. The Head of the Economy, Development and Longkungan Hidup District Section as the subdistrict administrator;
4. The responsibilities of the sub-district administrator, namely:
   a. Coordinate the utilization of the E-Musrenbang application;
   b. Verifying (rejecting/accepting) the proposed activity results of the village in the E-Musrenbang application;
   c. Validate data and complete administrative activities.

**Research Methods**

1. **Research Approach Perspective**

   The research approach used in this study uses qualitative research methods. According to Creswell (2008: 7) defines it as an approach or search to explore and understand everything central. To understand the central symptoms of the research, interview research participants or participants by asking general questions and broad questions. Information submitted to participants is then collected. The information is usually in the form of words or text. Data in the form of words or text is then analyzed. The results of the analysis can be in the form of descriptions or descriptions or it can be in the form of themes. From the data - the researcher interprets to capture the deepest meaning. Afterward, the researcher made a personal reflection and explained it with other scientific studies made earlier. The final results of the qualitative research are contained in a written report. This research is to get complete information about the Application of E-Musrenbang Application in the form of the process carried out and the obstacles encountered in the Mustikajaya Districts Office in Bekasi.

2. **Research Focus**

   Based on the formulation of the existing problems, the focus of this research is about the process of implementing the E-Musrenbang Application and the obstacles encountered in applying the E-Musrenbang Application in the Mustikajaya Districts Office in Bekasi City based on the Musrenbang Districts Handbook and Mayor Regulation No. 1.A. 2018.

3. **Research Location**

   The research location is the place where this research was conducted so that researchers can know the processes and obstacles encountered in the Application of E-Musrenbang. This research was conducted at the Districts Mustikajaya Bekasi City Office.

4. **Observation Phenomenon**

   This observation phenomenon contains discourse regarding the Application of E-Musrenbang Application, where the application is a new application that was implemented in the Development Planning Consultation (Musrembang) process so it needs to be observed in the process of applying the application in the field. Besides, whether the process of implementing the Musrenbang is following the Musrenbang District Guidebook and Mayor Regulation No. 1.A. 2018.

5. **Types and Data Sources**

   Primary Data is data obtained directly from research sources or research sites related to the problem under study. Primary data can be obtained directly from informants in the form of information by conducting interviews with the informant.
Interview, namely the use of methods carried out to dig deeper information related to research problems. This research uses an in-depth interview method, where researchers and informants/respondents face to face to obtain information orally with the aim of data that explains the research problem. To make interviews that contain questions - questions related to research problems.

Secondary data is data that is needed in research to complete primary data. This secondary data is used as a support to find the actual data. Secondary data is also needed to complete the information to match the data obtained. Secondary data in this study were obtained from scientific works, published books, newspapers, magazines, journals, laws and regulations and other sources relating to the problem under study.

6. Selection of Informants

Informants are people who know or are the actors directly involved with the research problem. This informant must have a lot of experience with research and can provide insights on the values, attitudes, processes, and culture that are the setting of local research. The informants in question are: Head of Districts Economic and Development Section Mustikajaya and Districts Development and Economics Staff Mustikajaya

7. Data Analysis Techniques

Data analysis is the process of systematically searching and compiling data obtained from interviews, field notes, and documentation. Data analysis conducted in this study was generally divided into the following four stages:

a. Collecting information through interviews with key informants that are compatible with research, then direct observation of the approaches to support the research conducted to obtain the expected data source.
b. Data Reduction is the process of selecting, focusing on simplification, abstracting, a transformation of rough data obtained from field notes. In this research, the reduction process is analytical that sharpens, classifies, directs, disposes of unnecessary data and organizes the data in such a way that conclusions can be drawn simply and can be explained.

Data Presentation is to present a collection of information in the form of narrative text which is assisted by a matrix, network, table and chart matrix, all of which aim to sharpen the understanding of the researcher towards the information obtained.

In the final stage, namely drawing conclusions and verification. Based on data obtained in the field, the researcher then compiles an understanding of the meaning of all events through data reduction, followed by systematic data compilation in the form of descriptions. Data reduction and data presentation are compiled at the time the researcher gets the data units needed in the study. After the data collection ends, the researcher tries to draw conclusions based on the verification of the field data.

Research Results and Discussion

1. Geography Conditions Village office Mustikajaya Bekasi City

Mustikajaya Districts is a part of Bekasi City located in the eastern part of Bekasi City which also acts as a buffer for the Capital City of Jakarta, which in its development has shown progress in various fields according to its role and function. Districts Mustikajaya has an area of around 2,621,947 ha, which is divided into 4 Village offices namely:

- Exod. Mustikajaya with an area of 930,747 Ha
- Exod. Mustikasari with an area of 512,750 Ha
- Exod. Padurenan with an area of 678,350 Ha
- Exod. Cimuning with an area of 500,100 Ha

Based on the formation of administrative boundaries surrounding the Mustikajaya Districts are:

- Northside, bordering South Tambun Districts.
- South side, bordering Bantar Gebang Kecamaan.
- West side, bordering Rawa Lumbu District.
- Eastside, bordering Setu Districts.
For population data, the number of population of Districts Mustikajaya in 2017 is 116,553 people, with 84,727 people and 81,826 people. The number of family heads in Districts Mustikajaya in 45,632 households with a total of 630 RT and 92 RW.

The vision of the Mustikajaya Districts is the Realization of Excellent Services towards Advanced Community, Prosperous, Ihsan. The main tasks of the Districts are 2, namely (1) assisting the Mayor in carrying out the authority of the government delegated by the Mayor to partially handle regional autonomy affairs and the task of assisting other general government tasks in accordance with his working area, (2) Delegation of authority determined by the Mayor Regulation. To carry out the main tasks and obligations, the District Office carries out the following functions:

a. Execution of local government authority delegated;
b. Implementation of the development of handling and coordinating community empowerment activities;
c. Coordinating efforts to administer peace and public order;
d. Coordinating the application and enforcement of laws and regulations;
e. Coordinating the maintenance of infrastructure and public service facilities;
f. Coordinating the implementation of government activities in the districts;
g. Fostering the administration of village government;
h. Implementation of community services which are the scope of their duties and / or which cannot be implemented by the village administration;
i. Performing other tasks and those given by the Mayor following their duties and functions.

ii. In the organizational structure, Districts are headed by a Camat as head of government. The assistant leader is the Secretary of the Camat and Subdivisions. Furthermore, the executor is a section and functional position.

2. E-Musrenbang Districts
E-Musrenbang is an application used to accommodate participatory planning processes in development planning in Bekasi City through the electronic system. This is to create consistency in the stages of regional development planning and to realize transparency, effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability of development planning to support the improvement of public service performance and encourage good and clean governance by utilizing information technology to produce consistent quality planning results.

In implementing E-Musrenbang, it is regulated by Mayor Regulation No.1A 2018. Users of the E-Musrenbang application who submit proposals through E-Musrenbang consist of Regional Apparatuses, Districts, Village office, RW and DPRD. In the implementation, the application user will get a username and password from the Central Administrator. The central administrator can also terminate E-Musrenbang users if the user violates the provisions and disrupts the E-Musrenbang system. In its application the E-Musrenbang application in districts is implemented with the following conditions:

a. Districts manage the use of E-Musrenbang;
b. The Camat Secretary is responsible for utilizing the E-Musrenbang application;
c. Head of Districts Economic, Development and Longkungan Life Section as district administrator;
d. District administrator responsibilities, namely:
   1) Coordinate the utilization of the E-Musrenbang application;
   2) Verify (reject/accept) the proposed activities of the village office results in the E-Musrenbang application;
   3) Validate data and complete administrative activities.

In carrying out these responsibilities Districts administrators are assisted by E-Musrenbang application operators.

3. Implementation of Mustikajaya District Musrenbang
The Mustikajaya District Musrenbang is held on Wednesday, February 21, 2018, at the Graha Bintang Village Building, Cimuning office. Before implementing the Musrenbang several agenda arrangements must be carried out as follows:

a. The Bekasi City Bappeda as the person in charge of Musrenbang Districts sets the schedule for the implementation of the Musrenbang Districts in each District.
b. The District Musrenbang Implementation Team compiles and summarizes the list of proposed activities from each Village office. The list of activities is sourced from the DU-RKP Village office of each Village office.

c. The District Musrenbang Team prepared the Draft District Development Work Plan. The Draft District Work Plan is a combination of the DU RKP Village office and proposed activities from the Districts SKPD.

d. The District Musrenbang Team collected data and information about the programs/activities that will enter Districts in 2018.

e. Prepare and distribute invitations to all Musrenbang Districts participants.

After the agenda has been prepared, the team will make preparations before the Musrenbang is implemented, with the following arrangement:

a. Message from the Head of Mustikajaya Sub-District and Opening of Musrenbang Districts

b. Explanation of Districts Musrenbang Agenda, by the Chair of the District Musrenbang Implementation Team.

c. Presentation (panel) and discussion:

- Presentation of Programs / Projects / Activities that will enter the Village office in 2018.
- Presentation of the SKPD Priority Program in 2018.
- Question and answer with participants in the Musrenbang Districts

d. Discussion and Determination of RKP Districts:

- Presentation of the Districts RKP Draft by the Secretary of the Camat as Chair of the District Musrenbang Implementation Team.
- Discussion of Districts RKP Draft by District Musrenbang participants.
- Group discussions to sharpen District RKP. Discussion groups are divided according to fields.
- Plenary of the results of group discussions.
- The stipulation of RKP Districts in 2018.

e. Determination of Districts Delegates who will attend the Bekasi City Musrenbang. District delegates numbered 3 people, consisting of Community Leaders and LPM and BKM.

f. District Work Plan (Renja)

g. The direction of the Districts development policy

District Development Planning Meeting was attended by 252 participants on several elements with the following details:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Element of Participant</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>DPRD member</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Elements of SKPD / UPTD</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Village Components</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Delegation of Pillars of Citizens (RT) and Pillar Neighborhood (RW)</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Representatives from community groups whose scope of activities is in the Village Office scale:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. LPM / BKM</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. PKK</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Community Organizations/ Figures</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>252</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data source: Minutes of the 2018 Budget Year Musrenbang Results Districts Mustikajaya
For attendance reports by invitation are as follows:

![Figure 1. Photo of Mustikajaya Bekasi Office Building Musrenbang Village Office](image)

Furthermore, based on reports from the Musrenbang Districts Mustikajaya Planning Year 2018 there are several proposals submitted in the Musrenbang forum. Some of the proposals were submitted by the Department as follows:

### Table 2. Proposed Offices in the Musrenbang Forum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Proposing Service</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Bekasi City Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Agency (DP3A). (Mrs. Lia Marliana, SH, M.Si)</td>
<td>The proposal for 2019 is the Coaching of Working Groups (Pokja) in handling cases of Domestic Violence (Domestic Violence) at the Village office and District level.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. | Bekasi City Library Service (Mr. Ahmad Yamin) | 1. Building a child-friendly library  
   - The right to play, the right to education, the right to protection, the right to a name (identity) and the right to obtain national status. There is the right to food, the right to access to health, the right to recreation, the right to equality and the right to have a role in development. All of these rights must be guaranteed if they want to make Bekasi City a Junior Level Eligible City. This is where the role of the Bekasi City Regional Library will be involved jointly with all other agencies.  
   2. Children's Innovation Championship  
   - Children's innovation championship is very important to develop talents and abilities that can not be channeled, and therefore will be developed to be able to follow the children's championship to innovate. The role of parents is very important to help trust children. |
| 3. | Bekasi City Agriculture, Fisheries and Animal Husbandry Department (Mrs. Sari) | 1. Development in the field of Hydroponics, Aquaponics and Ornamental plants.  
   - Hydroponics is the cultivation of cultivation by utilizing water without using soil by emphasizing the fulfillment of plant nutritional needs. Water needs in hydroponics are less than water requirements in aquaculture with soil and this is very suitable in areas that have limited water supply especially during the dry season. Aquaponics is now a trend in growing vegetables and fish farming. Even though it only has a narrow area, it can start vegetable crops as well as fish panes. Aquaponic vegetables do not require harmful fertilizers and pesticides. All plant nutrients are fulfilled from fish manure. So the principle is that fish pond water has flowed in the hydroponic garden system. Aquaponics is a combination of culture and hydroponics. There are various kinds of leaf vegetables and fish that can be cultivated using aquaponic systems such as kale, spinach, lettuce, chili, eggplant and leafy vegetables, and other fruit vegetables. For fish, you can use catfish, pomfret, gurameh, tilapia, etc.  
   - Development of increasing product value. |
How to increase the value of products and services in the business world is very important, given that more and more competitors are doing the same business. To face this competition, one needed is a strategy in conducting various marketing, such as one of them is to remind the value of products through quality services, certain goods or services. Aside from the quality of the yarn itself, also the price, of course, the assessment of service is an added value that is very calculated by consumers. Because no matter how good the quality of the product, if not balanced with friendly service, will push consumers away from the agreement to sell the goods. Therefore the Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Animal Husbandry in Bekasi City will conduct training on how to develop the value of products sold.

### Prevention of diseases of animal origin.

For example eczema, this disease is not contagious so animals do not need to be quarantined. But the most important thing is to find out the cause of animal diseases so that an appropriate solution can be found to treat and prevent transmission to other animals. An example is a disease caused by the amoeba, which mostly comes from polluted water. The water can be consumed by your other pets, so they remain sick even though the first animal that was sick has been quarantined. For this reason, it is important to consult with the Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Animal Husbandry in Bekasi City.

### Bekasi City One-Stop Integrated Investment and Services Agency (Mr. Drs. Herianda Yunus, MM)

The Office of Investment and Integrated Services One Door (DPMPTSP) of Bekasi City has officially opened a public service mall in Bekasi Junction, Jalan Ir. Juanda, East Bekasi. In that place, almost all permits are served, all population documents in the form of KK, electronic ID, and birth certificates can be arranged at the mall. Besides, it can also pay Land and Building Tax (PBB), as well as PDAM Tirta Patriot billing. As for police services serving crowds, Letters Police Note (SKCK) was previously known as Good Behavior Certificate (SKKB), an extension of validity of Driving License (SIM), and paying motor vehicle tax (STNK). Residents are also expected to no longer have to bother moving from one location to another and take the same time. Previously, those who did not want to be bothered handled through brokers and were subjected to extortion. The One-City Integrated Investment and Licensing Service Office (DPMPTSP) of Bekasi City also plan to make Districts One-Stop Integrated Services.

### Bekasi City Food Security Service (Mr. Yusuf Gozali)

Food security, namely food availability, food access, and food utilization. Food availability is the ability to have a sufficient amount of food for basic needs. Food access is the ability to have resources, both economically and physically, to obtain nutritious food. Food utilization is the ability to use food ingredients properly and appropriately proportionally. The function of the Department of Food Security is to maintain the stability of regional food availability.

---

Data Source: Department of Ekbang Section Memorandum February 2018

In addition to the proposals submitted by several of the Dinas above, the results of the annual Development Plan Deliberation activities also received input from priority development activities in the Mustikajaya Districts area. The number of proposals is as follows:

### Table 3. Proposed Priority Development Districts Mustikajaya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Proposing Proposed</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pillar Citizens</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Districts</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>262</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Source: Department of Ekbang Section Memorandum February 2018
Discussion

The application of the E-Musrenbang application is inseparable from the Operational Procedure System (SOP) that has been made in implementing the program into the current Musrenbang. This Operational Procedure System (SOP) is implemented as a procedure for implementing the Musrenbang that implements the application. Following is the Operational Procedure System (SOP) for e-Musrenbang application:

1. Pre-e-Musrenbang:
   a. Meeting on the drafting of SK Decree ceiling for the name of the activity, SK e-Musrenbang Team;
   b. Prepare materials, data, and information, draft SK Standard of the E-Musrenbang Team, SK schedule of activities and assignment tasks;
   c. Process materials, data and information into e-Musrenbang activities to process SK Standard ceiling for the name of the activity, SK e-Musrenbang Team SK, SK activity schedule and assignment;
   d. Receive and check reports on the readiness of organizing e-Musrenbang and submit reports to Bekasi City Bappeda;
   e. Process the initial data of the e-Musrenbang application in the form of a dictionary update proposal, add/delete users.

The e-Musrenbang team makes a guide to using the e-Musrenbang application:
   a. Organizing Workshops and Simulation e-Musrenbang applications;
   b. Submission of application login and password to all designated e-Musrenbang Teams.

2. Implementation of Village Office e-Musrenbang Level:
   a. Access e-Musrenbang application website address;
   b. Login as a Village office user;
   c. Entering the proposal of the Village Musrenbang results;
   d. Verifying the Village proposal;
   e. Print the minutes of the Village Musrenbang;
   f. Sending Village office proposal to Districts.

3. Implementation of District Level Musrenbang:
   a. Access e-Musrenbang application website address;
   b. Login as Districts user;
   c. Verifying the Village proposal;
   d. Print Minutes of District Development Planning Meeting;
   e. Sending proposals to Regional Apparatuses.

4. Implementation of e-Musrenbang at the Regional Apparatus Forum:
   a. Access e-Musrenbang application website address;
   b. Login as a Regional Device user;
   c. Approve / Reject proposals from Districts based on the results of the Regional Framework forum;
   d. Print minutes of Regional Device forums.

5. Post-e-Musrenbang:
   a. Access e-Musrenbang application website address;
   b. Login as Administrator user;
   c. Print recapitulation of Village and Districts proposals;
   d. Submit a recapitulation report of the approved proposal.

With the application of the application system there are several advantages and become more effective, efficient and transparent in the process of submitting a proposal as explained by Beni Muntasil as the Head of Economic and Development Section that:

"To produce a variety of executive output documents and information, the regional development planning and budgeting process runs effectively, efficiently and transparently to provide certainty to the follow-up of community proposals and can be accessed through musrenbang.kotabekasi.go.id. With this e-Musrenbang application system, in real-time, proposals..."
for programs or activities can be accepted by the Bekasi City Bappeda and the program accommodating SKPD. And no more proposals that arise without input through the system outside the established mechanism. The e-Musrenbang application can be accessed easily through various devices and can be input from anywhere online. E-Musrenbang is also able to be integrated with other information systems such as planning applications and monitoring and evaluation applications. This will maintain data consistency from planning to the realization of development activities. This system also maintains the suitability of RKPD data. E-Musrenbang itself has several levels of users according to their capacity and authority.

"With this e-Musrenbang application, Bappeda can maximize its function as a planner, controller, evaluator, and all parties involved in implementing the Musrenbang because everything has been arranged automatically in the system and the system is also able to present informative outputs for various parties. The government will be assisted in aligning, clarifying and agreeing on proposed activity plans for the Bekasi City RKPD draft. "(Interview results-August 20, 2018"

Based on the results of the interview with the e-Musrenbang application, the community's proposal through the Musrenbang can be seen directly in the musrenbang.kotabekasi.go.id application so that it makes the implementation more effective, efficient and transparent. Besides, the e-Musrenbang Bappeda application can maximize its function as a planner, controller, evaluator and all parties involved in its implementation because it can directly monitor the proposals submitted. So that the government can be assisted in aligning, classifying and agreeing on proposed activity plans for the Bekasi City RKPD draft.

This is in line with Law No. 25 of 20014 regarding 5 main functions of national development planning in the framework of integrated and efficient development, namely:

1. Support coordination between development actors.
2. Ensuring the creation of integration, synchronization, and synergy between regions, the time and function of government, both central and regional.
3. Ensure linkages and consistency between planning, budgeting, implementation, and supervision.
4. Optimizing the interrelationship and consistency between planning, budgeting, implementation and supervision.
5. Ensure the achievement of the use of resources efficiently, effectively and fairly.

In carrying out the facilities and infrastructure to carry out activities, this is very important because during the implementation the participants will conduct teleconferences directly with Bappeda. Based on interviews with informants for facilities and infrastructure such as computer equipment and the internet have been prepared in each village, as said by Marti Hartati as Staff Economic and Development Section: "We have prepared facilities and infrastructure to carry out activities, especially computer equipment and equipment the internet is, therefore, the main support in the implementation of Musrenbang "(Interview Results, 20 August 2018). In addition to the facilities and infrastructure that Human Resources (HR) for operators has also been prepared and have participated in training conducted by the Bekasi City Bappeda for Village Office and Districts Operators". As for the implementation, constraints must be found and we face it, which is related to a limited budget, so there are proposals for activities whose priorities are not realized properly ". Weak community aspirations can also be obstacles. This can be classified into two parts. External, namely conditions outside the government bureaucratic system such as the general public, internal, namely conditions within the government bureaucracy. Besides, the e-Musrenbang system that is sometimes problematic is related to its internet network "(Interview Results, 20 August 2018)

As for the obstacles experienced so far according to him, namely: "Coordination between SKPDs for the planning process is still weak so that activities built are rarely synergistic, even not infrequently appear egocentrically, the availability of funds that are not timely, and also in every Village office and Districts are not there adequate planning staff besides that many proposals have been submitted and have fulfilled the obligation to make plans but the realization is very minimal ".

From these constraints, it can be concluded that the lack of planning and planning process personnel is still weak and often emerges egocentric between SKPD causing many proposals that have been proposed but the realization is still minimal. As for the process and flow of the delivery of people’s aspirations that can be accepted in the proposal must be with complete requirements as explained by the informant: "Proposals that are not equipped with supporting data cannot be proposed and may not be included in the e-Musrenbang Information System. If the RW proposal is considered feasible and it is important to
be forwarded to the destination SKPD. In this case, the Lurah validated "agreed" the proposal was submitted to a higher level of Musrenbang.”

The factors that influence to be accepted and not accepted in the proposal according to the informant are: "Proposals through from the RW level will be entered manually in the Village office Musrenbang, at the village office Musrenbang the proposals for activities that are physical development activities at the RW level are verified with photos of conditions field. Then enter into the web page. Proposals that are already on the website are taken to the District Development Planning Meeting and re-verified. The screening of activities was carried out using the priority scale. After that, it is brought to the City level and combined with the proposed SKPD activities and the results of the recess of the whole regional council of their choice. And the factors that influence it are the accuracy of proposed activities, the lack of assistance, the lack of transparency in the implementation of Musrenbang and the budgetary factor"(Interview Results, 20 August 2018).

From these factors, it can be concluded that the accuracy between the physical building and the proposal is still incompatible and the lack of budget and transparency in the implementation of the Musrenbang thus hampering the proposals submitted in the Musrenbang forum. This can lead to technical failure of planning as conveyed by Sjafrizal (2014: 138), namely factors that cause the occurrence of plan failures, among others: (a) dualism of the formulation and determination of plans, (b) the direction of development that is less realistic, (c) weaknesses and planning techniques, (d) limited statistical data available, and (e) economic disruption (economic crisis) and natural disasters that were not previously predicted.

After the researchers rechecked the e-musrenbang application, it turned out that the application was now inaccessible. This is known when researchers asked the website musrenbang.kotabekasi.go.id is no longer accessible. The following image is the e-musrenbang website:

![E-Musrenbang Application Website](image)

Based on the picture above the website cannot be accessed because the musrenbang process has ended, the application is indeed not allowed to be accessed again by Bappeda, this is done to avoid the proposal that has been entered cannot be changed by irresponsible elements. Because the proposals that have been submitted have been adjusted to the existing budget so that"(Interview Results, 20 August 2018)

From the interview results above, it can be seen that the website cannot be accessed to avoid unwanted things. Because the incoming proposals have been adjusted to the existing budget. So the executor cannot access the application. The application can only be accessed by administrators who have been determined by the local government. In its management, those responsible for the E-Musrenbang application are:

1. Head of Bappeda as the person in charge of managing the E-Musrenbang application;
2. Head of Regional Development Analysis, Program Planning, Data, Evaluation and Reporting as the person in charge of the daily management of the E-Musrenbang system;
3. Head of the Regional Development Program Planning Sub-Division at Bappeda as the E-Musrenbang application center administrator as the technical person in charge of the E-Musrenbang application.
The central administrator referred to above is responsible for the continuity, smoothness, and security of the E-Musrenbang application; providing information related to the development of proposed activities included in the E-Musrenbang application system; Application security and handling problems and complaints from E-Musrenbang application users. The central administrator is assisted by the E-Musrenbang Application Management Team which consists of a Technical Team and a Supporting Team. Technical Team, namely experts/personnel who are experts and experienced in the field of information systems and technology. While the Supporting Team consists of implementing members of Bappeda, consisting of Super Admins and Field Admins.

Conclusions and Suggestions

Conclusion

Based on the results of the research and discussion described above, the conclusions of this study are as follows:

1. Development planning is the control and regulation of the economy carried out by the government to achieve a certain goal within a certain period as well.
2. Musrenbang is an annual government forum that is carried out using the bottom-up method and is used to carry out development planning from the lowest to the highest level.
3. In the implementation of the Musrenbang there are several proposals submitted by various elements. The proposal is in the form of human development and physical development.
4. E-Musrenbang is a breakthrough made by the Bekasi City Government-issued through Mayor Regulation Number 1A 2018, it produces several benefits in the process including:
   a) Programs that are proposed in real-time can be accepted directly by Bappeda and SKPD who accommodate the program.
   b) No more proposals appear without input through the system outside the established mechanism.
   c) E-Musrenbang applications can be accessed easily through various devices and inputted anywhere online.
   d) E-Musrenbang can be integrated with other applications such as planning applications, monitoring, and evaluation applications. This will maintain data consistency from planning to the realization of development activities.
   e) This system also maintains data suitability between SKPDs.
   f) Bappeda can also maximize its function as a planner, controller, and evaluator.
   g) E-Musrenbang also provides convenience because it is more efficient and effective to use.
5. In addition to the benefits of using the e-Musrenbang application, in its implementation also found obstacles and constraints, namely:
   a) Limited budget, so there are proposals that priority activities are not realized properly.
   b) Weak community aspirations become an obstacle; it can be classified into two parts. External, namely conditions outside the government bureaucratic system such as the community. And internal, namely the conditions of the government bureaucracy itself.
   c) The system sometimes has problems related to network connections.
   d) Coordination between SKPDs is still weak, so the activities that are built are rarely synergistic, sometimes even egocentric.
   e) There are not enough planners in each Village office and District.
   f) Many proposals have been submitted and have fulfilled the obligation to make a plan but the realization is very minimal.
6. The application cannot be accessed right now because it is to avoid things that are not wanted by people who are not responsible.

Suggestion

Based on the above conclusions, the authors submit the following suggestions:

a. The need for training so that planners are available in each Village office and Districts that are sufficient so that the processes that become obstacles and obstacles can be resolved.
b. Should the application be divided into two systems, namely to change and only to see? So after the Musrenbang process is complete the application system can still be seen by the public. Also, the public can see what proposals are submitted.
c. The need to provide better facilities and infrastructure, especially for internet access so that when the implementation takes place is not hampered by the internet network.

The need for an additional budget so that priority programs can be realized properly.

References

7. Panduan Musrenbang Districts, RKPD Kota Bekasi Tahun 2019 (Memperkuat Tata Kelola Struktur Perekonomian), Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Kota Bekasi Tahun 2018
9. Peraturan Walikota Nomor 01.A, Tahun 2018 tentang Penerapan Aplikasi E-
11. Priansa, Donni Juni, 2017, Manajemen Pelayanan Prima (Fokus pada Organisasi Publik dan Peningkayan Kualitas Aparatur), Alfabeta, Bandung